



## STAFF REPORT

### Complete Streets Commission

**Meeting Date:** 12/12/2018  
**Staff Report Number:** 18-013-CSC

**Consent Calendar:** **Recommend to the City Council to approve the Draft Belle Haven Neighborhood Traffic Management Plan**

### Recommendation

Staff recommends the Complete Streets Commission recommends to the City Council to approve the revised Draft Belle Haven Neighborhood Traffic Management Plan (Plan).

### Policy Issues

The development of the Plan and its implementation fulfill “Mitigation Measure TRA-3.1” of the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP) established in the Facebook Campus Expansion Project Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) approved in 2016. As it is a requirement of the MMRP, this effort is not identified in the 2018 Council Work Plan; it is considered part of staff’s baseline work.

### Background

On November 1 and November 15, 2016, the City Council completed actions to approve the Facebook Campus Expansion Project FEIR. The FEIR concluded that the proposed development would generate several significant and adverse environmental impacts and established a set of feasible mitigation measures to reduce the severity and magnitude of these impacts. To ensure successful implementation and monitoring of these mitigation measures, the FEIR established a MMRP. Hibiscus Properties, LLC on behalf of Facebook, identified as the Project Sponsor in the MMRP, is financially responsible for the development, design, and/or implementation of these measures.

One of the identified mitigation measures is the development, design, and implementation of a traffic calming plan for the Belle Haven neighborhood. The Plan is intended to address neighborhood cut-through traffic, through the use of traffic calming measures, as a result of future added traffic on major streets such as Bayfront Expressway, Marsh Road, and Willow Road.

Traffic calming measures generally consist of educational, enforcement, and physical measures to influence driver behavior. Physical measures can include, but are not limited to, speed humps, intersection or mid-block curb extensions, raised intersections, signing and striping, etc. The Belle Haven neighborhood is defined as the area bounded by Willow Road to the east, the Dumbarton Rail Corridor to the north, and US 101 to the south.

On October 17, 2017, the City Council approved the draft scope of work to initiate the study for the development of the Plan. Through community feedback, the scope of work was further amended to include the evaluation of the Ringwood Avenue and Van Buren Road intersection and the Beechwood School / Onetta Harris Community Center parking lot. A consultant was selected and the study commenced immediately following approval of the scope, and traffic data was collected in November/December 2017

and supplemented in early 2018.

Since the initiation of the study, traffic impacts to the Bayfront area and Belle Haven neighborhood have been exacerbated due to the number and severity of ongoing construction projects on Chrysler Drive, Independence Drive, Chilco Street and Constitution Drive proceeding simultaneously. Cut-through traffic has continued to worsen within the neighborhood as a result.

On June 19, 2018, in response to a request submitted by the Belle Haven residents on May 22, 2018, the City Council adopted a resolution authorizing the implementation of “no through traffic” signs at four critical entry points to the neighborhood to discourage cut-through traffic. All signs have been installed.

Prior to installation of these new signs, other traffic calming measures had already been implemented in the neighborhood throughout the years. They included:

- Left turn restriction from southbound Chilco Street to eastbound Hamilton Avenue, during weekday evening commute hours
- Bulbouts at the intersection of Chilco Street and Hamilton Avenue
- Roadway closure on Henderson Avenue at Ivy Drive, Howard Street at Windermere Avenue, Windermere Avenue at Chilco Street, and Ivy Drive in front of the Belle Haven Branch Library
- Traffic circle at the intersection of Ivy Drive / Market Place / Ringwood Avenue
- Speed humps on Terminal Avenue, Henderson Avenue, Windermere Avenue, Hollyburne Avenue, Sevier Avenue, Madera Avenue, Carlton Avenue, and Pierce Road
- A 15 miles per hour (mph) school zone bounded by Hamilton Avenue, Chilco Street, Ivy Drive, and Almanor Avenue.

On July 11, 2018, the Complete Streets Commission held its meeting in the Belle Haven Senior Center to review the draft Plan with many residents in attendance. Through a comprehensive data collection effort, the Plan identified Ivy Drive and Newbridge Street, through Chilco Street to be the main cut-through routes during the morning and evening peak periods. The Plan also revealed that Hamilton Avenue carried minimal cut-through traffic; likely due to the existing no left turn restriction from southbound Chilco Street, as identified above.

Recognizing the difficulty of trying to reduce cut-through traffic significantly without creating a high level of inconvenience to both neighborhood and service vehicles, the Plan recommended measures that could potentially reduce speed while providing secondary benefits, such as additional streetscape and added safety for biking and walking within the neighborhood at key locations. In addition, the Plan developed up to three alternatives for the three key streets: Chilco Street, Ivy Drive, and Newbridge Street. These alternatives, including their opportunities and challenges, are summarized in Attachment A.

Through comprehensive discussions with the Commission and residents, adjustments were suggested to the Plan. Ultimately the Commission, through input from residents, recommended to staff to continue to work with the neighborhood to develop a final draft plan with one set of recommendations and present it at a future Complete Streets Commission meeting.

## **Analysis**

Following the Commission meeting, staff worked with the consultant to develop a revised draft Plan based on the Commission and resident feedback. To solicit additional resident feedback on the revised Plan, large poster boards of the Plan were produced and displayed at the following key Belle Haven neighborhood locations between September 10, 2018 and October 1, 2018:

- Menlo Park Senior Center
- Belle Haven Branch Library
- Belle Haven Neighborhood Service Center

Through the poster boards, approximately 40 additional comments were collected and can be categorized as follows:

- Supportive and/or opposing comments on specific Plan recommendations
- New comments that will require further evaluation after the implementation of the Plan
- New comments that will be addressed by other ongoing City projects (e.g., the Transportation Master Plan)

The Transportation Master Plan (TMP) is a citywide document that when completed, will identify and prioritize transportation infrastructure and policy projects intended to enhance the City’s transportation networks citywide while meeting the communities’ goals and values.

Key comments collected from the poster boards and staff responses are summarized in the table below:

Comments	Responses*
<b>Comments supporting specific Plan recommendations</b>	
Support for a majority of the recommendations	Noted.
Majority support for gateway treatment - Option 3	Option 3 will be installed unless there is significant design or cost constraints.
<b>Comments opposing specific Plan recommendations</b>	
No Bike Lane on Ivy Dr. and Newbridge St, maintain existing on street parking	Bike lane recommendation has been removed due to community opposition to parking removal.
No edge lines on Ivy Dr. and Newbridge St	Currently Ivy Dr. provides on-street parking and Newbridge St does not provide on-street parking. Edge lines will not eliminate the on-street parking.
<b>New Comments</b>	
Left turn signal on Hamilton Ave at Willow Rd should be protected with a left turn arrow	Intersection is under Caltrans jurisdiction. Transportation Master Plan Recommendation #38 is intended to address this comment.
More pedestrian safety measures on Ivy Drive and Willow Rd	Intersection is under Caltrans jurisdiction. Transportation Master Plan Recommendation #39 is intended to address this comment.
Lower speed limit of Chilco St near the school to 15 miles per hour	The street segments surrounding the Belle Haven School are currently designated as 15 miles per hour school zones.
More speed feedback signs	Two speed feedback signs are currently recommended for Ivy Dr. to enhance awareness. The need for additional feedback signs will be evaluated after the Plan has been implemented.
Speed humps on Ivy Dr. and Newbridge St	Bulbouts are currently recommended for most intersections on Ivy Dr. and Newbridge St. Newbridge St is a designated Emergency Response Route and Ivy Dr is within the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission right-of-way.

	The need for speed humps will be evaluated and approved by these agencies after the Plan has been implemented.
Blank-out sign at Willow Rd and Hamilton Ave needs more clarification	The blank-out sign, prohibiting the SB right turn (from SB Newbridge St to WB Willow Rd), will be activated when the EB left turn is activated. This is intended to eliminate conflicts between SB right turning vehicles and SB u-turning vehicles (into the frontage Willow Rd).
Enforce no right turn restriction at the current Instagram driveway on Chilco St	Noted.
No shuttle buses from Facebook or others on Ivy Dr.	Noted.
* SB = southbound, EB = eastbound, WB = westbound	

After the collection of these boards, two additional comments were received. Both comments and staff responses are summarized in the table below:

Comments*	Responses
No NB right turn (from NB Newbridge St to EB Carlton) from 3 p.m. to 6 p.m. to discourage traffic from diverting from Willow Road	Analyses and community outreach will be needed for this request. Staff does not recommend the inclusion of this request into the Plan at this time .
Consider reversing the direction of traffic on the Willow frontage Rd. between Newbridge St. and Pierce Rd.	Analyses of the transportation impact by this request requires significant resources. Staff does not recommend the inclusion of this request into the Plan at this time.
* NB = northbound, EB = eastbound, WB = westbound	

Note Chilco Street from Hamilton Avenue to Ivy Drive will be a distinct project to be implemented by the Menlo Gateway development. The revised Plan is illustrated in Attachment B.

Key outside agencies coordination

As stated in previous staff reports, while the City has jurisdiction over a majority of public roadways within the neighborhood, some recommendations will require coordination and/or consensus from focused neighborhood areas and other agencies. These agencies include:

- San Francisco Public Utilities Commission has jurisdiction over Ivy Drive and approval authority for the implementation of roundabout and raised intersection recommendations on Ivy Drive.
- Caltrans has jurisdiction over Willow Road and approval authority for the implementation of the limited right turn restriction on Newbridge Street at Willow Road.
- Menlo Park Fire Protection District has interest in adequate roadway width and turning radii for the implementation of bulb outs and mid-block curb extensions.

Coordination with these agencies will be needed if a trial and/or permanent Plan is approved.

Plan Implementation process and schedule

If approved, the implementation of the Plan will be consistent with the policies and guidelines outlined in the City’s Neighborhood Traffic Management Program (NTMP) approved in 2004. As outlined in the NTMP, implementation of any trial and permanent traffic calming measures will need to go through a

comprehensive neighborhood review process to ensure they are equitable and effective solutions.

With the extensive amount of outreach completed thus far, staff is recommending the following streamlined implementation process:

1. Incorporate minor Commission and community feedback through the December 12, 2018, Complete Streets Commission meeting and develop a Final Plan for City Council adoption. This is anticipated to occur during winter 2019.
2. If adopted, develop design plan set and specification for the 6-month trial implementation and begin dialogue with outside agencies having jurisdiction on certain applicable measures. To expedite installation of temporary improvements, it is proposed to forgo the voting process to yet again obtain majority support.
3. When design plan set and specifications are completed, select contractor to implement temporary measures. Measures requiring outside agency approvals could be implemented as approvals are obtained.
4. Collect new transportation data six months after implementation and receive community feedback through a survey and one community meeting for final feedback.
5. Following receipt of community consensus at the community meeting, prepare final design plan set and specification for permanent implementation. To expedite installation of final traffic calming measures, it is proposed to forgo the requirement of a formal voting process.
6. When design plan set and specifications are completed, contractor to install all measures, including ones that have received outside agencies approval.

The implementation process above is expected to expedite the schedule by approximately four months. And as stated above, traffic calming measures that require consensus from other jurisdictions may have longer implementation schedules.

#### Other ongoing neighborhood efforts

Through public feedback, the City has been engaging with Caltrans on several intersections along Willow Road between Hamilton Avenue and Newbridge Street, which are currently under Caltrans' jurisdiction. In addition to what has been identified in the tables above, other efforts include:

- Add red clearance phase to signals along Willow Road
- Reverse the order of the existing signal phase at Newbridge Street

#### **Impact on City Resources**

As a required condition of approval for a development project, staff time on the Belle Haven traffic calming study, development, and implementation of the Plan is considered part of the baseline City service levels. The trial and permanent implementation costs of the Final Plan would be funded by Hibiscus Properties, LLC.

#### **Environmental Review**

The Plan does not require California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review. Implementation of future traffic calming measures will comply with environmental review requirements under CEQA.

#### **Public Notice**

Public notification was achieved by posting the agenda, with the agenda items being listed, at least 72 hours prior to the meeting.

**Attachments**

- A. Draft Plan Alternatives for Primary Cut-through Routes
- B. Draft Belle Haven Neighborhood Traffic Management Plan

Report prepared by:  
Kevin Chen, Associate Transportation Engineer

Report reviewed by:  
Morad Fakhrai, Senior Project Manager